Council Chambers City Hall, Saskatoon, SK Monday, December 8, 2003 at 5:00 p.m.

MINUTES OF SPECIAL MEETING OF CITY COUNCIL

PRESENT:	His Worship Mayor D. Atchison, Chair
	Councillors Alm, Birkmaier, Dubois, Fortosky, Heidt, Hnatyshyn,
	Neault, Paulsen, Penner, and Wyant
	City Manager Richards;
	City Planning Branch Manager Sully;
	General Manager, Infrastructure Services Uzelman;
	City Solicitor Dust;
	City Clerk Mann;
	Special Projects Manager Peakman
	Councillors' Assistant Long.

His Worship the Mayor advised that this special meeting of City Council has been called in order to consider the following reports.

Clause 2, Report No. 16-2003 of the Executive Committee Redevelopment of Gathercole Site (File No. CK. 4130-2-11)

RECOMMENDATION: that a special meeting of City Council be scheduled for Monday, December 8 at 7:00 p.m., in order to consider the following report.

The Executive Committee, at its Gathercole Planning Session held on Tuesday, November 25, 2003, developed the following proposed resolutions for public input, debate and decisions at a special meeting of Council to be held on Monday, December 8, 2003 at 7:00 p.m. in the Council Chambers.

Throughout the report, the "Gathercole site" means all of the lands south of 19th Street to the river, and bounded by Third Avenue on the east and the Senator Sid Buckwold Bridge on the west.

Public Access

Public access to the river is a key component of the Gathercole site, and the most important aspect of such public access is the riverfront "park" now under construction along the southernmost part of the property, which received \$4 million in funding from the Provincial Government. The second most important aspect is the roadway access and the sightlines it produces.

Proposed Resolution #1: That the roadway access to the Gathercole site be the extensions of Second Avenue and Spadina Crescent shown on the attached map.

Implications: If this resolution passes, servicing of the Gathercole site can proceed, including the construction of the streets and streetscaping. The Administration would be instructed to complete servicing during the 2004 construction season, such that further development of the City lands on the site could begin in the Fall of 2004. The Administration would also be instructed to enquire into the possibility of potential funding from other levels of government for the enhancement of the streets (e.g. brick rather than pavement).

The proposed location of Second Avenue has implications for the Gathercole Building, as set out in Resolution #3 below.

DCD1 Guidelines

Public access (including sightlines) is also affected by the height, mass and location of buildings south of 19th Street, by the amount of open space between buildings south of 19th Street, and by the uses of those building and the land around them.

Proposed Resolution #2: That City Council review the DCD1 guidelines for the Gathercole site.

Implications: If this resolution passes, the Administration would be instructed to bring forward the appropriate public process for reviewing the DCD1 zoning of the Gathercole site (as this zoning addresses all of the issues set out) with the final hearings to be complete by June 30, 2004. Again, this will mean that any changes to the DCD1 guidelines are in place in time for Fall 2004 development of City-owned lands.

Gathercole Building

It is proposed that **either** Resolution #3a or Resolution #3b would be passed by Council after public input and debate.

Proposed Resolution #3a: That the Gathercole Building be demolished.

or

Proposed Resolution #3b: That the East Wing of the Gathercole be first offered for sale for adaptive reuse on the condition that no City money, either capital or operating, will be made available in relation to the sale. If no buyer satisfactory to the City is found, then the whole Gathercole Building will be demolished.

- Implications: 1) If Resolution #3a passes, the Administration would be instructed to remove the asbestos from the Building and proceed with demolition. They would also bring forward proposals as to how the City-owned lands south of 19th Street might be marketed or developed in the Fall of 2004 (after servicing and after review of the DCD1 guidelines).
 - 2) If Resolution #3b passes, the Administration would be instructed to first bring forward a proposal as to how the East Wing would be offered for sale. This process would take place as soon as possible. In the meantime, the Administration would proceed with the demolition of the remainder of the building in order that the construction of Second Avenue and the servicing of the site can proceed.

Proposed Resolution #4

4. That the Administration identify any historical artifacts in the Gathercole Building which should be saved.

Proposed Resolution #5

5. That the Administration bring forward the appropriate reports and recommendations resulting from the decisions of the special Council meeting of December 8, 2003.

Report of the City Manager Possible Sale of the East Wing of the Gathercole Building (File No. CK. 4130-2-11)

<u>RECOMMENDATION</u>: that the information be received.

The sale of any partially demolished building creates unusual challenges; however, should City Council resolve to offer the east wing of the Gathercole Building for sale, the following report discusses those items that should be considered.

1. Demolition

To complete the servicing of the site by October 1, 2004, that part of the building that will interfere with servicing should be demolished by June 1, 2004. As it is preferred that the asbestos be removed in warmer weather, this part of the demolition should not begin before April. The City should remove the asbestos from the whole building prior to beginning demolition.

Demolition can begin as soon as the asbestos is removed and could take up to two months. If the building is removed in one phase the demolition estimate (including asbestos removal) is \$1,238,000.00. If the east wing is left and the demolition is done in two phases, it is estimated that phase one will cost \$983,000.00 and phase two will cost \$355,000.00 (asbestos removal included in phase one) for a total of \$1,338,000.00. The two-phase demolition is therefore \$100,000.00 more costly. This would leave the east wing with no heat, no power, and temporary walls in all areas where adjacent demolition has occurred. It is our opinion that leaving the building unheated over winter would cause significant structural damage.

2. Site for the East Wing

The attached sketch shows a possible site containing the east wing of the building. The building footprint is 15,527 square feet and it contains approximately 46,500 square feet on three floors. Using the recommended 65% site coverage in the DCD1 Guidelines, this would result in a site area for the building of approximately 24,000 square feet; however, to conform to the side-yard requirements in the building code, the site should be approximately 34,800 square feet. The size of the site required for the east wing could be reduced if we knew that the building was to be sprinklered and/or if we knew its intended use. Creation of any site for the building will require meeting all building codes for the specific uses envisioned. The final site configuration is therefore yet to be determined. It should be noted that creating this site for the east wing leaves an awkward parcel between it and the extension of Second Avenue.

3. Sale of the East Wing

We have conducted an investigation of the sale of the east wing and offer our preliminary observations. The following points are not intended to be the terms and conditions of sale, but rather are simply to give Council an idea as to how it could occur.

We are recommending that, if the east wing is sold, it be done by public tender, with a reserve bid and subject to conditions.

• Reserve Bid

We are recommending that no value be set on the building shell of the east wing, but that the land be valued at full market value. We have requested an appraisal, but for the purposes of this report, we are using a serviced land value of \$25.00 per square foot. This would result in a value of \$870,000 for the site, which would be the reserve bid.

• Conditions

Because at least part of the building has to be demolished to build Second Avenue, the east wing would be sold with temporary wooden walls securing the building envelope and with a significant

part of the original west wall missing. There will also be no building services including water, electricity, heat, or security system.

Accordingly, we would recommend that a condition be attached to the sale, which requires the purchaser to build a permanent wall and make satisfactory arrangements for heating the building prior to obtaining title.

The alternative is to simply sell the building for full market value with payment in full and immediate possession. The sale would be on the understanding that the purchaser has no requirement to put any money into the building, and Council's only remedy would be the building and fire code enforcement.

The sale would also be subject to the necessary Meewasin Valley Authority approvals.

• Timing

If Council were to instruct that the east wing be advertised and offered for sale by public tender, your Administration can confirm the site size and configuration and present the sales criteria to City Council for approval at its meeting of January 5, 2004. The building could then be tendered in January to close 60 days later in March.

PUBLIC NOTICE

Public Notice pursuant to Section 3 of Policy No. C01-021, Public Notice Policy, is not required.

ATTACHMENT:

1. Sketch showing site for east wing of Gathercole Building.

The City Clerk submitted copies of the following correspondence requesting permission to address Council:

- 1. Jan Norris, dated November 18, 2003;
- 2. Lenore Swystun, dated November 24, 2003;
- 3. Betsy Bury, dated November 24, 2003;
- 4. Raoul Granger, dated November 25, 2003;
- 5. Rusty Chartier, dated November 25, 2003;

- 6. Dianne Wilson-Meyer, dated November 25, 2003;
- 7. Grant Whitecross, Nutana Community Association, dated November 25, 2003;
- 8. Peggy Sargeant, President, Saskatoon Heritage Society, dated November 25, 2003;
- 9. Ramesh D. Mahabir, President, Saskatoon Farmers' Market, dated November 26, 2003;
- 10. Ryan Lejbak, dated November 26, 2003;
- 11. Robin Riehl, undated;
- 12. Paul Jordan, Manager of Operations and Programming, The Forks North Portage Partnership, dated November 28, 2003;
- 13. Mr. Charlie Clark, dated November 29, 2003;
- 14. Tim Ryan, dated November 30, 2003;
- 15. Valerie Veillard, dated December 2, 2003;
- 16. Denis Rouleau, Artistic Director, La Troupe du Jour, dated December 2, 2003;
- 17. Todd Brandt, Tourism Saskatoon, dated December 3, 2003;
- 18. Gordon McKay, dated December 2, 2003;
- 19. Terry Scaddan, Executive Director, The Partnership, dated December 3, 2003;
- 20. James B. Leach, undated;
- 21. Mark Bobyn, December 3, 2003;
- 22. Megan Clark, dated December 3, 2003;
- 23. Jeffrey Mueller, President, Magpie Film Studio, dated December 3, 2003;
- 24. Lawrence Rychjohn, dated December 3, 2003;
- 25. Phill Elenko, dated December 3, 2003;
- 26. David Gerecke, dated December 3, 2003;

- 27. Jodi Crewe, Communications Director, Riversdale Community and School Association, dated December 3, 2003;
- 28. Harry H. Janzen, CAE, Executive Officer, Saskatoon Real Estate Board;
- 29. Bernie Cruikshank, dated December 3, 2003;
- 30. Allan J. Evans, Business Manager, Prairie Centre Policy Institute;
- 31. Kent Smith-Windsor, Executive Director, The Saskatoon and District Chamber of Commerce;
- 32. Roland L. Dumont, dated December 1, 2003;
- 33. Susan Lamb, Meewasin Valley Authority, dated December 4, 2003 requesting permission for John Gerstmar to address Council on behalf of the Meewasin Valley Authority;
- 34. Bob Fink, dated December 4, 2003, 2003;

The City Clerk also submitted copies of the following correspondence:

- Wayne MacDonald, dated November 19, 2003;
- Jan Norris, dated November 18, 2003;
- Lucille Canart, dated November 24, 2003;
- Tom Wolf, dated November 25, 2003;
- Richard Medernach, dated November 25, 2003;
- Genevieve Oakes, dated November 25, 2003;
- Susan Gingell, dated November 25, 2003;
- Tim Quigley, dated November 25, 2003;
- Paul Olszynski, dated November 25, 2003;
- Shirley Enslin, dated November 25, 2003;
- Dr. Jim McLoughlin, dated November 25, 2003;
- Steven Reed, dated November 25, 2003;
- Adrienne Assaly, dated November 25, 2003;
- Gord Androsoff, dated November 25, 2003;
- Fay Minifie, dated November 25, 2003;
- Courtney O'Brien-Moran, dated November 25, 2003;
- Rev. Bill Bernard, dated November 25, 2003;
- Marie Dunn, dated November 25, 2003;
- Maureen Latta, dated November 25, 2003;
- Linda Stark, dated November 25, 2003;

- Brenda Baker, dated November 25, 2003
- Nancy Allan, dated November 25, 2003;
- Wendy Roe, dated November 26, 2003;
- Sharon Esler, dated November 26, 2003
- Darrel Epp, dated November 26, 2003;
- Patricia Englund, dated November 26, 2003;
- Penny Anderson, dated November 26, 2003;
- Cuyler Onclin, dated November 26, 2003;
- Tara Driedger, dated November 26, 2003;
- Gion A. Bezzola, dated November 26, 2003;
- Tyson McShane, dated November 26, 2003;
- Fred J. Sutter, dated November 26, 2003;
- Peter Spearey, dated November 26, 2003;
- Kathy Allan, dated November 26,2 003;
- Jack Wigham, dated November 26, 2003;
- Arthur Slade, dated November 26, 2003;
- Carmen Perret-Smith, dated November 26, 2003;
- Robert Smith, dated November 26, 2003;
- Brenda Reid, dated November 26, 2003;
- Christine Bobyn, dated November 26, 2003;
- Peter Kingsmill, dated November 27, 2003;
- Randeah Robertson, dated November 27, 2003;
- Miranda Jones, undated;
- Leslie C. Coleman, undated;
- Barbara Wieler, dated November 28, 2003;
- Carol Cisecki, dated November 29, 2003;
- Charlie Clark and Sarah Buhler, dated November 29, 2003;
- David Leswick, dated December 1, 2003;
- Medbh English, dated December 1, 2003;
- Smita Garg, dated December 1, 2003;
- Sarah M. Buhler, dated December 1, 2003
- Greg McKee, dated December 2, 2003;
- Georgie Davis, dated December 2, 2003;
- Crystal Clarke, dated December 2, 2003;
- Dorothy Johnstone, dated December 2, 2003
- Susan Gilmer, Dave Glaze, Sarah Glaze, Alice Glaze, dated December 2, 2003;
- Trevor McKenzie-Smith, dated December 2, 2003;
- Karen Heise, dated December 3, 2003;
- Herman Boerma, dated December 3, 2003;
- Joseph Kuchta, dated December 2, 2003;

- Len Usiskin, Manager, Quint Development Corporation, dated December 3, 2003;
- Rachel Buhler, dated December 3, 2003;
- John Sargeant, Chairman, Building Review Committee, Branch #63, Royal Canadian Legion, dated December 1, 2003;
- Susan Lamb, Chief Executive Officer, Meewasin Valley Authority; December 2, 2003;
- Dr. Dan Pennock, Civics Director, Nutana Community Association, November 30, 2003;
- Tony Haynes, Chair, Community First Development Fund of Saskatoon, Inc., dated December 3, 2003;
- Kent Macaulay, dated December 3, 2003;
- Mr. and Mrs. O.D. Bobyn, undated;
- Megan Clark and Dale Bayda, undated;
- Roland L. Dumont, dated December 1, 2003;
- Mark Bobyn, dated December 3, 2003;
- Warren Chykowski, dated December 3, 2003;
- Don Kossick, dated December 4, 2003;
- James Hodges, dated December 4, 2003;
- Gordon S. Glen, undated;
- Fred and Elaine Konkin, dated December 5, 2003;
- A.D. (Al) Rosseker, Director, Saskatchewan Architectural Heritage Society, dated December 5, 2003;
- Doug Peters, dated December 5, 2003;
- Todd Raine, dated December 7, 2003;
- John McConnell, dated December 7, 2003;
- Candace Savage, dated December 8, 2003;
- Keith Bell, dated December 8, 2003;
- Cliff Speer, dated December 8, 2003; and
- Christine Varnum, dated December 8, 2003.

The City Clerk advised Council that Denis Rouleau, La Troupe du Jour and Allan J. Evans, Prairie Centre Policy Institute, have withdrawn their requests to address Council.

The City Clerk advised Council of three additional letters, which were not received in time to be included on the agenda, from Patricia Tutty and William Walker, Patricia Williams and Maya Moore, all expressing support for the retention of the Gathercole building.

Moved by Councillor Paulsen, Seconded by Councillor Penner,

THAT the speakers be heard.

CARRIED.

Ms. Jan Norris spoke with respect to the environmental impact of development of the Gathercole site, and requested that Council not make a decision until an environmental assessment is done. She expressed the opinion that the Gathercole building should not be demolished, but converted into energy-efficient housing. She provided Council with a copy of her presentation.

Ms. Lenore Swystun gave a presentation outlining the Gathercole Initiative Group's proposal, including costs and their wish to save the building.

Ms. Betsy Bury advised that she is a resident of the inner city. She expressed the opinion that there should be a strong mix of public and private development on the site, and concerns regarding extending 2^{nd} Avenue through to the river. She provided Council with a copy of her presentation.

Mr. Raoul Granger indicated that he was present representing La Troup du Jour. He asked that Council vote against the proposed resolutions and spoke in support of the cultural proposals for the site. He provided Council with a copy of a report from the City of Kelowna entitled "Economic Impact of Arts & Culture".

Mr. Rusty Chartier provided Council with a copy of a document entitled "The Downtown of the 21st Century A Discussion Report" prepared by the International Downtown Association and expressed the opinion that decisions regarding the development of the downtown should be community driven. He provided Council with a copy of his presentation.

Ms. Dianne Wilson-Meyer expressed the opinion that the Gathercole building not be demolished, and discussed the importance of keeping the heritage buildings in the City. She also discussed the importance of keeping the building useable, attractive and accessible to all people, and expressed concerns with respect to putting a road through the site.

Mr. Grant Whitecross, Nutana Community Association, indicated the Committee Association's support of the retention of the Gathercole building, and a development similar to the Gathercole Initiative Group's proposal. He provided Council with a copy of his presentation.

Ms. Peggy Sargeant, Saskatoon Heritage Society, expressed the importance of maintaining the Gathercole building, and requested that Council look at all options. She provided a copy of her presentation, as well as drawings from the South Downtown Urban Design Study prepared for the Meewasin Valley Authority in 1982.

Mr. Ramesh D. Mahabir, Saskatoon Farmers' Market, thanked Council for its support in the past, and outlined the importance of a permanent Farmers' Market in the City. He provided Council with a copy of a report entitled "A Market for Saskatoon", dated November 26, 2003.

Mr. Ryan Lejbak indicated that he is a business owner in the City. He expressed concerns with respect to a roadway in the middle of the site, and asked that Council defeat or defer the resolutions until the impact has been studied carefully. He expressed support for a multi-use site.

Mr. Robin Riehl spoke with respect to Resolutions 1 *and* 2. *He circulated a model of how he*'*d like to see the area developed*, *and expressed concerns regarding the roadway in the middle of the site.*

Mr. Paul Jordan, The Forks North Portage Partnership, spoke with respect to the successes of multi-use facilities in other cities, including the Forks in Winnipeg, and urged Council to consider this type of proposal for the site.

Mr. Charlie Clark expressed the opinion that the City needs something to bring the community together, and something to get excited about. He expressed support for a multi-use facility similar to the Forks in Winnipeg.

Mr. Tim Ryan expressed support for the demolition of the Gathercole building and the construction of residences on the site.

Ms. Valerie Veillard expressed the importance of planning, and concerns with respect to a road in the middle of the site.

Mr. Todd Brandt, Tourism Saskatoon, indicated that it is important that the development of the site maximize Saskatoon's tourism potential. He provided Council with a copy of his presentation.

Mr. Gordon McKay outlined the work done by the volunteers of the Gathercole Initiative Group, and explained that they are not developers but rather it was their intent to present a concept and turn it over to the planners at City Hall. He expressed support for the adaptive reuse of the Gathercole building, and expressed concerns with respect to a road through the middle of the site.

Mr. Terry Scaddan, The Partnership, spoke in support of the demolition of the Gathercole building and a road through the site, indicating that this has been included in the studies done in the past.

Mr. James B. Leach expressed support for a multi-use facility and opposition to the demolition of the Gathercole building He provided Council with a copy of his presentation.

Mr. Mark Bobyn gave a presentation outlining the desired plan for a restored Gathercole building. He expressed support for a public, multi-use facility.

Ms. Megan Clark expressed support for a public market on the Gathercole site.

Mr. Jeffrey Mueller, Magpie Film Studio, indicated his wish to purchase the Gathercole building to build a film production company.

Mr. Lawrence Rychjohn outlined his interest in constructing a hotel, and renovating the Gathercole building to provide a residential section of the hotel. He indicated that he would only be using part of the site, which would still leave a portion open for a Market Landing type of development.

Mr. Phill Elenko indicated that he is representing a developer who wishes to purchase the property for mixed-use development. He asked for a process to look at all of the offers fairly, and asked that the Gathercole building not be demolished.

Ms. Linda Frank, Chair, Persephone Theatre, indicated that she was present to speak on behalf of David Gerecke. She indicated that are prepared to address any questions that Council may have with respect to their plans for the site.

Ms. Jodi Crew, Riversdale Community Association, expressed the Community Association's support for a Market Landing type of development for the site, and requested that Council vote down the resolutions.

Mr. Harry H. Janzen, Saskatoon Real Estate Board, advised Council that the Board feels strongly that in order for the development to be successful, there needs to be a residential component.

Ms. Bernie Cruikshank indicated that she was speaking as a private citizen and also as the President of the Friends of the Forestry Farm House. She expressed concerns with respect to demolition of the Gathercole building, and the importance of maintaining the City's heritage buildings.

Mr. Kent Smith-Windsor, The Saskatoon and District Chamber of Commerce, expressed the opinion that it is not necessary to keep the Gathercole building in order to have a multi-use facility, and that it isn't necessary for a gathering place to be created by the public sector.

Mr. Roland L. Dumont expressed concerns with respect to the demolition of the Gathercole building.

Mr. John Gerstmar, Meewasin Valley Authority, outlined the Meewasin Valley Authority's role in plans for the Gathercole site, past and present.

Mr. Bob Fink expressed concerns with respect to the demolition of the Gathercole building. He provided Council with a copy of his proposal.

Moved by Councillor Penner, Seconded by Councillor Paulsen,

THAT the correspondence be received.

CARRIED.

Moved by Councillor Birkmaier, Seconded by Councillor Penner,

THAT the meeting recess for ten minutes.

CARRIED.

The meeting adjourned at 10:00 p.m. and reconvened at 10:15 p.m.

Moved by Councillor Alm, Seconded by Councillor Hnatyshyn,

THAT the roadway access to the Gathercole site be the extensions of Second Avenue and Spadina Crescent shown on the map attached to Clause 2, Report No. 16-2003 of the Executive Committee.

CARRIED.

Moved by Councillor Birkmaier, Seconded by Councillor Penner,

THAT City Council review the DCD1 guidelines for the Gathercole site, and submit a report to Council regarding the review process by January 19, 2004.

CARRIED.

Moved by Councillor Alm, Seconded by Councillor Wyant,

1) THAT the East Wing of the Gathercole be first offered for sale for adaptive reuse on the condition that no City money, either capital or operating, will be made available in relation to the sale, and that if no buyer satisfactory to the City is found as of April 1, 2004, the whole Gathercole Building be demolished; and 2) that the Administration report in January regarding the process for sale of the building.

Moved by Councillor Paulsen, Seconded by Councillor Neault

THAT the motion be amended to read as follows:

- 1) THAT the East Wing of the Gathercole be first offered for sale **or lease** for adaptive reuse on the condition that no City money, either capital or operating, will be made available in relation to the sale and that if no buyer/lessee satisfactory to the City is found by April 1, 2004, the whole Gathercole Building be demolished; and
- 2) that the Administration report in January regarding the process for sale or lease.

THE AMENDMENT WAS PUT AND CARRIED. THE MOTION AS AMENDED WAS PUT AND CARRIED ON A RECORDED VOTE.

	Councillors Alm, Dubois, Heidt, Hnatyshyn, Neault, Paulsen, Penner, and Wyant	8
NAYS:	His Worship the Mayor, Councillors Birkmaier and Fortosky	3

Moved by Councillor Paulsen, Seconded by Councillor Heidt,

THAT the Administration identify any historical artifacts in the Gathercole Building which should be saved, including the façade, and that prospective developers of the property be encouraged to include same in their developments.

CARRIED.

Moved by Councillor Hnatyshyn, Seconded by Councillor Dubois,

THAT the Administration bring forward the appropriate reports and recommendations resulting from the decisions of the special Council meeting of December 8, 2003.

CARRIED.

Moved by Councillor Penner, Seconded by Councillor Wyant,

THAT His Worship the Mayor and the City Manager consider holding regular meetings among all of those involved financially in the South Downtown area, including Princeton Developments, the Government of Saskatchewan and the Government of Canada, if they feel that is necessary, in order to keep everyone on the same wavelength with respect to things that are happening in the South Downtown.

CARRIED.

Moved by Councillor Birkmaier, Seconded by Councillor Fortosky,

THAT the Administration report on the opportunities for the reuse of materials from the demolition of a portion or portions of the Gathercole, including reuse through other organizations, such as Habitat for Humanity.

CARRIED.

Moved by Councillor Birkmaier

THAT the meeting stand adjourned.

CARRIED.

The meeting adjourned at 12:35 a.m.

Mayor

City Clerk